



## DELTA STEWARDSHIP COUNCIL

---

980 NINTH STREET, SUITE 1500  
SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA 95814  
WWW.DELTACOUNCIL.CA.GOV  
(916) 445-5511

December 5, 2012

Maria Rea  
Sacramento Area Office Supervisor  
National Marine Fisheries Service  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, California 95814-4706

Sue Fry  
Mid-Pacific Region Area Manager  
United States Bureau of Reclamation,  
Bay-Delta Office  
801 I Street, Suite 140  
Sacramento, CA 95814

Mike Chotkowski  
Field Supervisor  
United States Fish and Wildlife Service.  
San Francisco Bay-Delta Fish and Wildlife  
Office  
650 Capitol Mall, 8-300  
Sacramento, California 95814

Dear Ms. Rea, Ms. Fry and Mr. Chotkowski:

**Re: Report of the 2012 Delta Science Program Independent Review Panel (IRP) on the Long-term Operations Opinions (LOO) Annual Review**

The Delta Science Program is pleased to present the enclosed review report entitled, "Report of the 2012 Delta Science Program Independent Review Panel (IRP) on the Long-term Operations Opinions (LOO) Annual Review." The transmittal of this report fulfills a request from the National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS), United States Bureau of Reclamation (USBR), and United States Fish and Wildlife Services (USFWS) to provide annual independent external review of implementation of the RPA Actions in the NMFS and the USFWS Long-term Operations biological opinions for the state and federal water projects. The 2012 IRP report is the third of three IRP reports.

The overall goal of this peer review was to inform NMFS as to the efficacy of the prior year's actions prescribed by its respective Clear Creek RPAs, with the goal of developing lessons learned, incorporating new science, and making appropriate scientifically justified adjustments to the RPAs or their implementation. This year's review also included a review of the implementation of the 2012 Spring Delta Operations in lieu of NMFS's RPA Action IV.2.1 per joint stipulation.

The independent review panel consisted of Dr. James Anderson, Dr. James Gore, Dr. Ron Kneib, Dr. Mark Lorang, Dr. John Nestler and Dr. John Van Sickle. These panel members were selected for their expertise and reputation concerning anadromous fish, hydrology, estuarine ecology,

---

*"Coequal goals" means the two goals of providing a more reliable water supply for California and protecting, restoring, and enhancing the Delta ecosystem. The coequal goals shall be achieved in a manner that protects and enhances the unique cultural, recreational, natural resource, and agricultural values of the Delta as an evolving place."*

– State Water Code §85054

hydrodynamics and transport modeling, and environmental statistics. The panel met in public meetings on October 31 - November 1, 2012.

Detailed information on the Long-term Operations Opinions Annual Review can be found on the Delta Science Program web page (<http://deltacouncil.ca.gov/science-event/7842>). The Delta Science Program was pleased to assist in the process of evaluating the 2012 water year implementation of the RPA Actions and the 2012 Spring Delta Operations through open and transparent scientific peer review.

If there are questions about the 2012 Long-term Operations Opinions Annual Review, IRP report, or the overall process, please contact Lindsay Correa, Environmental Scientist, Delta Science Program, at (916) 445-0092.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "P. Goodwin". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Peter Goodwin, Ph.D.  
Lead Scientist, Delta Science Program  
Delta Stewardship Council

Enclosure

Cc: Garwin Yip, National Marine Fisheries Service  
Donna Garcia, United States Bureau of Reclamation  
Traci Michel, United States Bureau of Reclamation  
Jennifer Norris, United States Fish and Wildlife Service